



*International  
Task Force on Teachers  
For Education for All*



United Nations  
Educational, Scientific and  
Cultural Organization  
Tổ chức Giáo dục,  
Khoa học và Văn hóa  
của Liên Hợp Quốc

**Ha Noi Office**  
Office of the Representative to  
the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam  
**Văn phòng Hà Nội**  
Văn phòng Đại diện tại nước  
Cộng hòa Xã hội Chủ nghĩa Việt Nam

## Report of the Hanoi Workshop

# *Addressing the EFA Teacher Gap: What Makes Effective Policies and Practices in Asian Countries?*

Case Studies on: Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Vietnam

November 28-29, 2011



### ***Acknowledgement***

*We would like to thank the Head of UNESCO Vietnam office Ms Katherine Muller-Marin, and the whole team of the bureau of Vietnam for their effort and contribution to the success of the workshop.*

## Contents

<b>I. Background and Introduction.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>II. The Case Studies.....</b>	<b>3</b>
1. Bangladesh.....	3
2. Indonesia.....	4
3. Vietnam .....	5
4. Synthesis.....	6
<b>III. Panel Discussion .....</b>	<b>8</b>
1. Sri Lanka.....	8
2. India .....	8
3. China .....	9
4. Other Comments .....	9
<b>IV. Conclusion .....</b>	<b>9</b>

## **Background and Introduction**

The International Task Force on Teachers for EFA is undertaking a “Taking Stock, Taking Action” exercise to review and analyze existing policies and practices that have been undertaken by national governments to address the teacher gap in basic education, indicating their commitment to the goals of Education for All. The Task Force puts specific emphasis on the most vulnerable segments of society who continue to be denied access to basic education of quality, including the poorest quintile, their educators and their communities. The studies look at key sub-sectors’ most pertinent issues according to country and context, and are undertaken in cooperation with national partners in a participatory manner.

The aim of the studies is to provide information and evidence of policies and practices that work or do not work to address the EFA teacher gap, with the awareness that there can be much variance among countries of the same region, and disparities within countries (therefore extrapolating when possible or applicable to the region but mainly looking at sub-national realities or under-served areas). The studies could also provide an idea of the potential for progress towards achieving the EFA goals by 2015 by reducing the teacher gap, and help identify the requisites for policies and practices to work based on known interventions that can be effective, adaptable and replicable.

The studies intend to provide reliable information on existing initiatives led by national governments to address the teacher gap and the challenges faced in implementation. They will contribute to facilitating reflection and discourse on practices; enhance communication and strengthen the capacity of the education sector by identifying good practices which can be taken to scale or be replicated elsewhere. The studies should therefore provide a comprehensive synthesis of lessons learned, analysis of in-country strategies and organizational dynamics to address specific contextual challenges (including cultural ones).

To develop a stronger ownership of the studies by national governments, and to maintain the involvement of the global alliance of the Task Force members and partners, the studies are undertaken by a consultant from the region who should work in close collaboration with the Task Force country focal point, existing partners working at country or regional level, and the Secretariat of the International Task Force on ‘Teachers for EFA’. The process of information gathering, interpretation and validation should involve national leadership. The three case studies are ready for Indonesia, Vietnam and Bangladesh. The regional synthesis is produced based on the outcomes of the three case studies. It is in this context that a validation workshop was organized on Monday 28 and Tuesday 29 of November 2011 in Hanoi, Vietnam.

## **I. The Case Studies**

### **1. Bangladesh**

#### **Presentation**

*By Prof. Scheerer*

It is very encouraging to know how Bangladesh has progressed in increasing the access to basic education. However, drop-out rate is high and the quality of education needs more attention. Teachers in Bangladesh are provided by multiple sources: registered non-primary schools, private primary

schools, community schools, and non-formal schools. Schools are mainly managed by two ministries but other ministries also support different types of schools.

Non-formal primary education contributes to EFA goals by providing a second chance to children who did not enroll in formal primary education or who had dropped out. It is supplementary and complementary to the mainstream education, and even more effective sometimes. Non-formal primary education provides: continuous training of teachers, supportive academic supervision, co-curricular activities, community monitoring. These initiatives should be adopted in the formal schools.

### **Feedback from Bangladesh**

57% of primary teachers in Bangladesh are female. This is a result of the government's affirmative policy to increase the number of female teachers and the special provision for female trainee teachers. Bangladesh has also introduced ICT in education. E.g. laptops have been given to teachers as part of a pilot project. There is also a separate TV channel for teachers to promote good teaching practices. Teachers are very crucial in achieving the 6 EFA goals; therefore the study is timely and helpful. Teaching methods and process skills of the teachers are stimulated through training. 83% of the teachers are trained and have qualifications. The following topics are also covered in the feedback: Teacher-student ratio, Teacher-student contact hours, curriculum and textbooks, teaching and learning environment, positive motivation, subject based training, cluster based training, special programme on training, one week refresher courses.

### **Discussion**

#### ***Chaired by Mr. Man-Sheng Zhou***

The number of entry teachers, outcomes and effectiveness of the programmes are missing from the presentation. It would be good to see the real outcome and effectiveness of the programmes as illustrations of good cases. It would also be good if the study could include both costing and non-costing recommendations and solutions to the problems.

It was also pointed out that having multiple service providers means there are different teachers with different qualifications and salaries. Concerns were raised if there are any career tensions and if these post any implications on teachers' motivations. Is the system of multiple teachers a strength or weakness? The following questions were also asked: How to use technical schools to support teacher training? What is the correlation between high drop-out rates, repetition rates and the quality of teachers, in particular at early grades?

## **2. Indonesia**

### **Presentation**

#### ***By Prof. Scheerer***

The government has made great efforts to improve the quality of education by putting teachers at the centre of its education policy. Policies were developed within a legal framework.

Under-qualified teachers are upgraded through continuing education. Teacher certification, professional allowance for certified teachers are conducted. Annual performance appraisal is based on core required competencies in four areas: Pedagogical, Professional, Social and Personal. A programme of Continuing Professional Development (CPD) is conducted.

An in-service school-based training cycle, which includes school team workshop, cluster teacher training, mentoring, coaching and assessment, is also provided for teachers.

Four functional levels for teachers: Novice, Junior, Middle and Senior are developed. Teachers are required to follow CPD and cannot move between functional levels without sufficient approved CPD. Every single teacher must have CPD for their career and it is crucial for promotion.

### **Feedback from Indonesia**

Some data in the report is misleading. However, the report recognizes the direction that Indonesia has taken is right. The current teacher-student ratio is 1:45. The government cannot deploy teachers to another place.

The question of the value of decentralization versus the increase in under-qualified teachers was raised. It was also expressed that there is a need for the national standard to ensure equity.

### **Discussion**

#### ***Chaired by Dr. Edem Adubra***

The following questions were explored: While there is a high percentage of unqualified teachers, there seems to be an incentive for districts to recruit those unqualified teachers. What are the reasons? Who carries out the assessment of performance? What does it cost, taking into account the magnitude of the teaching corps? How are principals trained in appraising teachers? How are the appraisals monitored? The appointment of head teachers seems to be quite critical. Does that not create risks?

## **3. Vietnam**

### **Presentation**

#### ***By Prof. Scheerer***

It is found that there is a positive relationship between teacher quality and student outcome. Equity is also found to be a problem: students in urban areas are strongest in reading skills while those in isolated areas are the weakest.

The national EFA Action Plan aims at improving education quality and professional standards of teachers in the country: 45 days per year of in-service training is required, teacher appraisal has to be related to the criteria of professional standards, and terms of service are revised to attract high quality candidates to enter the teaching profession. The Primary Teacher Professional Standards (PTPS) were developed to appraise teacher performance in these areas: professional ethics, commitment and leadership, subject matter and curricular knowledge, and teaching methods. Also, a reliable and valid yearly assessment of students' learning allows linking the improvement of pupil learning to incentives for teachers.

### **Feedback from Vietnam**

Some data were not correct; it did not focus on the obstacles for improving teacher quality to meet EFA. The report was also based on the results of some projects implemented in some areas of Vietnam, and only focused on primary education. There are new initiatives from 2011 to 2015. 1) New national policy on comprehensive and holistic innovation in education: innovate teacher training system (TTIs), improve benefits for teachers, strengthen innovative examination and assessment, innovate educational management. 2) Institutionalize in-service training for improving teachers' capacity in disadvantaged

areas. The strategies for addressing the teacher gap: both quality and quantity have to be tailored to countries' specific needs and socio-political contexts. Investment and allocation of more experienced and better qualified teachers to early grades have to be increased.

#### **4. Synthesis**

##### **Presentation**

*By Prof. Scheerer*

The followings are key factors to better already improved school systems: a good system, prioritizing teacher quality over class size, attractive salaries and career prospects. To make teachers better instructors, these four approaches were found to be effective: building practical skills during initial training, placing coaches in schools, selecting and developing effective instructional leaders, and enabling teachers to learn from one another. Today's greatest need is an effective policy that attracts qualified people into the teaching profession, retaining them and providing them with the necessary skills and supports are vital. Ensuring that teacher deployment systems distribute teachers equitably is also crucial to achieving more equitable learning outcomes.

##### **Comments and Discussion**

*Chaired by Mr. Purna Shrestha and Mr. Norihiro Nishikata*

It would be helpful if the report has covered education financing policies and how countries have addressed financial gaps. It could be very useful for participating countries to learn the lessons.

The composition of the teacher work force can make an enormous difference. An extensive body of evidence demonstrates a positive association between the presence of teachers from socially excluded groups (e.g. female, people with disability, ethnic and linguistic minorities) and the enrolment of and learning achievement of children from excluded groups. This is because teachers inevitably carry social and cultural attitudes into the classroom, including prejudices about students' abilities. E.g. in Nepal, most teachers belong to upper castes and several studies indicate that strong prejudice against Dalit and socially marginalized ethnic minorities is a factor commonly cited by parents for withdrawing their children from school. Therefore, it would be useful to include policy initiatives from case study countries that contribute to inclusive teaching force.

The policy should also address how to increase teachers' motivation. VSO's Valuing teachers research shows that teachers' motivation are not always linked only with salary, terms and condition, but also non-financial support such as appreciation, timely payment of their salary and social protection ( e.g. health insurance, housing loan etc.). These also attract teachers to work in remote areas.

It would be good to analyze some regional data. National level figure does not always present regional and geographical disparities. Inequalities between regions and schools should also be narrowed.

Linking effective teachers with disadvantaged children is important. Too often well-trained teachers are concentrated in the schools that serve children from predominately higher socio-economic groups. Fairer distribution of qualified teachers is also crucial.

## II. Panel Discussion

***Chaired by Mr. Noorhaizamdin Abdullah and Mr. Van-Hoan Pham***

The following countries were not involved in the case studies. However, they were invited to share experiences in their countries to the panel.

### **1. Sri Lanka**

There is high teacher absenteeism in the country, which leads to low teaching hours. National data is needed to reflect inequality of teachers and the big teacher gap. The management of teachers is complicated, in many cases, the appointment of head teachers are politically driven. Universities can assist in training teachers. In order to meet the EFA targets and as part of continuous quality improvement in schools, there is a need to ensure all children are in school and learning to their best ability. This involves schools developing strategies and practices to remove any barriers that prevent some children participating in the learning process.

Therefore, there is a need to: strengthen teachers' skills to teach a wide range of ability and ensure all children are included in the learning process, strengthen teachers' capacity to use a variety of teaching methodologies, strengthen teachers' ability to identify those children that are experiencing difficulties and provide interventions and support to help them overcome these barriers.

Strengthening the system to support implementation of training into practice is also important: all teacher training should be delivered by using participatory and activity based methods that reflect inclusive practice, assessment of trainee teachers should be more practically based, and all training should be monitored and its levels of implementation and impact should be assessed.

The workshop is useful for Sri Lanka, which need to go further to develop quality of teaching. It could be useful if they can share these recommendations with the government. There are other good practices that we could adopt in our own context.

### **2. India**

There are 2 million teachers in India, 3% of the GDP is spent on education. 10% of the 1 million teacher trainees pass the examination. To become a teacher, one has to study 3 years of subject specific course and 1 year of professional course, and pass the test.

The right to education is legally bounded in India. 70% of schools are run by the government, and the rest is run by private institutions. 7 students out of 70 proceed to higher education after secondary education.

The teacher education quality is poor due to poor inputs, lack of resources and a series of cadre and institutional constraints. Private bachelor of education programmes are sub-standard, there is also an absence of a specialised cadre of teacher educators. Existing graduates, even from central universities, are poorly prepared for teaching jobs. There is also a systematic exclusion of research and academic support to school teachers. The institutes of teacher education remain insular even within universities, and the teaching in Teacher Education Institutes based largely on traditional lecture methods.

The Teacher Education Scheme is launched. The improvement in status and professional competence of teachers is cornerstone of educational reconstruction. Teacher education envisaged as a continuous



process; pre-service and in-service training are inseparable components. The significance and need for decentralizing the system for the professional preparation of teachers are emphasized. In this context, DIETs, CTEs and IASEs were established.

### **3. China**

Chinese education reform is still being explored. In general, China can concentrate sufficient national financial resources to do big things, but there is still a low per capita income and a large disparity of wealth. China has no intention to promote their own development path and experience to other countries. Similarly, we believe that any country should go for their own path of development. Development paths of different countries can respect each other and learn from each other. It is an emerging issue, the MoE is in process to develop teacher policy. VSO has been asked to support the sub-working group.

The workshop seems very meaningful and successful. UNESCO made good efforts to increase collaboration between South Asian countries. Higher salaries, other initiatives and new policies have been formulated in China. China would like to collaborate with this initiative further.

### **4. Other comments**

Effective mechanism, recommendations bring appropriate actions. They can be taken into consideration in preparing for future initiatives.

There may be different issues when considering the country contexts. The paper needs to be corrected if we could have time to provide some input, thus the unique situation of each country can be reflected. With suggestions from other stakeholders, the validation could take place.

## **III. Conclusion**

*By Dr. Amarjit Singh*

### **The way forward**

The following suggestions were made for the way forward for teacher education.

Firstly, the teacher education gaps have to be identified. The role of legal framework is important, e.g. the Constitutional Amendment (2002) and New Law on National Education System (2003). In terms of annual performance appraisal, teachers' competencies in subject knowledge, as well as pedagogical, professional, social and personal skills should be included. Principals should be trained in leadership, and administrators should be trained in effective management of teacher education interventions.

In terms of continuous professional development, there should be focus on professional competencies, student achievement and management, school development and development of the profession. The career pathways for teachers, improvement of learning environments, quality in teacher training institutions, use of ICT in teacher education, teacher recognition are also significant issues.

On the other hand, it is repeatedly expressed that the report has to be finished as soon as possible. Many showed the hope in incorporating their countries' inputs in the report, and hoped to share the revised paper in their countries.

The discussions were very fruitful. All participants stressed the importance of such meetings that allow countries to share their policies and practices, but also learn from the experience of other teachers in

policy. The next step is to gather all the inputs, from countries which have made the case studies, to integrate them into the final document for publication.

**Closing of the workshop**

The workshop was closed by the Minister of Education of Vietnam; he recommended that the results of the studies will be published with the governments in order to share best practices. He expressed that Vietnam would like to joined the alliance as soon as possible.

**Press conference**

After the closing ceremony, UNESCO office of Vietnam organized a press conference to share the conclusions of the workshop with the media.